Centre for Child Law submissions On the

Children's Amendment Bill, 2020

CONTRIBUTORS:

Karabo Ozah karabo.ozah@up.ac.aza

Fortunate Seneka Mongwai fortunate.mongwai@up.ac.za





NAME OF ORGANISATION/DIRECTORATE/DEPARTMENT/PROVINCE: Centre for Child Law, University of Pretoria, Gauteng

DATE: 31 March 2025 (Resubmission)

COMPILED BY: Karabo Ozah and Fortunate Mongwai

CONTACT DETAILS: 012 420 4502

(PLEASE COMPLETE COLUMNS 1-4)

Clause number	Clause title	Proposed amendment/addition	Reasons/Rationale
1. Section 1 –	Abandoned child	Proposed amendment	We are of the view that South Africa
definitions			should consider baby savers to
		This definition is not supported	combat the critical issue of unsafe
			infant abandonment, which has
			severe consequences, including
			infant mortality. Research by
			Rosenburg indicates that baby
			savers provide a secure option for
			mothers to relinquish their infants
			safely, significantly reducing the
			risk associated with unsafe
			abandonment in perilous locations
			such as toilets and open fields. The
			anonymity offered can alleviate
			fears of social stigma or legal

Clause number	Clause title	Proposed amendment/addition	Reasons/Rationale
			repercussions, encouraging
			women to opt for this safe
			alternative. In her study, Rosenburg
			proposes the urgent introduction of
			baby savers and/or "baby safe
			haven laws" (as proposed by
			Namibia), drawing on successful
			models from other countries and
			Namibia's experience. The
			alarming number of infant
			abandonment cases in South Africa
			highlights this need; in 2020 alone,
			of the 83 reported abandoned
			infants, 49 were found dead. This
			situation calls for immediate action
			to prevent further tragedies
			associated with unsafe infant
			abandonment. Some of the cases
			go unreported, and some of the
			statistics are not clear.
			Furthermore, we argue that

Clause number	Clause title	Proposed amendment/addition	Reasons/Rationale
			criminalising baby savers would be
			another reactive measure, focusing
			on penalising a potentially life-
			saving action rather than providing
			a preventative solution to a complex
			societal problem.
			The focus should be on
			implementing and supporting
			mechanisms like baby savers that
			offer a safe harbour for abandoned
			infants, thereby upholding their
			fundamental rights, rather than
			criminalising these potentially life-
			saving initiatives. Such
			criminalisation would likely
			exacerbate the existing problem of
			unsafe infant abandonment and
			infant mortality in South Africa.
	Adoption service	No prosed amendment	The inclusion of "guardian" ensures
			that all those who have parental

Clause number	Clause title	Proposed amendment/addition	Reasons/Rationale
			responsibilities and rights in relation
			to the child are supported in the
			process of consenting to an
			adoption.
	After-care	No proposed amendment	We welcome the insertion of
			auxiliary social workers or social
			service practitioner responsible for
			adoption services into the definition
			as auxiliary social workers play a
			crucial role in supporting and
			assisting professional social
			workers by providing essential
			frontline services. In contrast, the
			role of social service practitioners
			providing after-care for adoption
			services is invaluable in ensuring
			that both the child and the adoptive
			family succeed in the long term.
			They provide essential emotional,
			educational, and practical support
			to foster healthy adjustment, protect

Clause number	Clause title	Proposed amendment/addition	Reasons/Rationale
			the stability of the family, and help
			children and parents thrive in their
			new family dynamic.
	Clerk of the court	No proposed amendment	
	Family counsellor	Supported	We are of the view that it is
		No proposed amendment	important that counsellors are
			trained to mediate in cases where
			there is family conflict, particularly
			between parents who are
			separated or divorced. In such
			cases, counsellors must use
			therapeutic and conflict resolution
			techniques to help parents work
			together in the best interests of the
			child, ensuring that care and
			contact arrangements are made
			with the child's emotional and
			psychological needs in mind.
	Genital Mutilation	Supported	The substitution of the definition will
		No proposed amendment	ensure that we are aligned with the
			international law definition of genital

Clause number	Clause title	Proposed amendment/addition	Reasons/Rationale
			mutilation which is broader and
			aims to provide better protection.
	Inter-country adoption	No proposed amendment	
	Midwife	No proposed amendment	
	Nurse	No proposed amendment	
	Separated migrant child	Supported	This definition aligns with the
		No proposed amendment	universal definition used
			internationally and nationally. It
			must be noted that most of these
			children are often undocumented.
	Sexual abuse		We welcome and note the insertion
			of any sexual offences against
			<u>children</u> this definition is broad
			enough to cover sexual abuse as
			defined in the Criminal Law (Sexual
			Offences and Related Matters Act)
			32 of 2007.
	Temporary safe care	No proposed amendment	
	Unaccompanied migrant child	Proposed amendment:	The definition in the United Nations
			Convention on the Rights of the
			Child does not include the word

Clause number	Clause title	Proposed amendment/addition	Reasons/Rationale
		"Unaccompanied migrant child' means a	"citizen". As such, this should be
		child [from a foreign country] who has	deleted and replaced with the
		been separated from both parents or other	proposed amendment.
		adult family members and is not being	
		cared for by an adult who, by law or custom,	
		is responsible for doing so".	
General principles	Amendment of section 6 of Act	Supported	We welcome the substitution in
	38 of 2005 – 6(2)(d)	No proposed amendment	paragraph 6(2)(d), as any form of
			discrimination against children must
			be prohibited
	Section 6(2)(f)	Supported	The inclusion of accessible and
		No proposed amendment	inclusive makes the obligation to
			accommodate the needs of children
			with disabilities very clear.
3. Section 6A	Children's right to privacy and	Proposed amendment:	The insertion of protection of
	protection of personal		children's right to privacy and
	information	We then propose the following:	personal information must be line
		Section 6A(a)	with legislation that protects both
		No person may, without permission of a	privacy and personal information is
		court, in any manner publish any	hereby welcomed. This must be
		information relating to the proceedings of a	made clear

Clause number	Clause title	Proposed amendment/addition	Reasons/Rationale
		court which reveals or may reveal the name	
		or identity of child who is a party or a	
		witness in the proceedings;	
		6A(b), a person mentioned under para (a)	
		above must comply with legislation relating	
		to the right to privacy and the protection of	
		personal information is subject to the Film	
		and Publication Act, 1996 (Act No. 65 of	
		1996); Protection of Personal Information	
		Act, 2013 (Act No 4 of 2013); the	
		Promotion of Access to Information Act,	
		2000 (Act No. 2 of 2000); the	
		Criminal Procedure Act, 1977 (Act No. 51 of	
		1977) or any other law protecting	
		the privacy and protection of personal	
		information of the child.	
4. Section 7	Amendment of Section 7	Supported	The deletion of <u>"and"</u> is supported,
		No proposed amendment	and the insertion of paragraph (o) of
			any special needs that a child may
			have is supported.

Clause number	Clause title	Proposed amendment/addition	Reasons/Rationale
5. Section 8	Amendment of Section 8	Supported	The amendment will ensure that
		No proposed amendment.	unaccompanied, separated
			children have access to care and
		The current amendment – $(\underline{4})$ This Act	protection without any
		applies to every child in the Republic of	discrimination. Particularly
		South Africa is supported.	considering that most of them lack
			documentation such as birth
			certificates or passports.
6. Section 12	Amendment of Section 12 -	Supported	The insertion of the word must is
	age of consent to marriages	No proposed amendment of section	welcome is it ensures that no child
		12(2)(a)	below the age of 18 must consent
			to marriage of any sort. This is a
			step in the right direction to address
			the issue of child marriages and
			practices of Ukuthwala and also
			ensure that the legislation that
			governs marriages in South Africa
			are harmonised and prohibits child
			marriages.

Clause number	Clause title	Proposed amendment/addition	Reasons/Rationale
	Section 12(3) – genital	Supported	This is supported as it is in line with
	mutilation or circumcision	No proposed amendment	the African Charter on the Rights
			and Welfare of the Child.
7. Section 13	Amendment of section 13	No proposed amendment	We support the amendment of
			disabled with with disabilities.
8.	Amendment id heading of Part	No proposed amendment	The separation Part and Part 1A
	1 of Chapter 3 of Act 38 of		are clear.
	2005 – <u>Automatic</u>		
	acquisition of parental		
	responsibilities and rights		
9. Section 19	Amendment of section 19 -	Proposed amendment:	This is because the word is
	Parental Responsibilities and		outdated and the preferred terms
	Rights of Mothers	We propose deleting the word <u>custody</u>	are "care and contact"
		under subsection (2)(a).	
		We further propose that in Section 1 of the	
		definitions, the word "residence" should be	
		included and defined.	
10. Section 21	Amendment of section 21 -	Not supported, we proposed the following:	The insertion of the provision in
	Parental Responsibilities and		section 1A will create disputes and
	Rights of Unmarried Fathers		become an additional barrier to

Clause number	Clause title	Proposed amendment/addition	Reasons/Rationale
		21(1)(b)(i) consents to be identified or	fathers in particular and does not
		successfully applies in terms of section 26	advance the approach of ensuring
		to be identified as the child's father or has	that children form a relationship
		complied with required customary law	with both their parents. It is
		practices.	regressive to include that cultural
			practices "must" be complied with
			before a father obtains parental
			responsibilities and rights, and
			actually, such a clause is open to a
			constitutional challenge.
			Our proposed reframing of the
			current section 21(1)(b)(i) is a better
			option that recognises customary
			practices without elevating them
			above the best interests of the child.
			The cases of Hlope v Mahlalela
			1998 (1) SA 449 (T) and <i>Maneli v</i>
			Maneli 2010 (7) BCLR 703(GSJ)
			make this point clear.
11.	Insertion of heading Part 1A	No proposed amendment	
	after section 21		

Clause number	Clause title	Proposed amendment/addition	Reasons/Rationale
12. Section 22	Amendment of section 22	Supported	We welcome the insertion of
		No proposed amendment	subsection 2(A), which clearly
			indicates the importance of child
			participation. We support any
			further insertions and deletion of
			subsection (7).
13. Section 23	Amendment of section 23	No proposed amendment	
14. Section 28	Amendment of section 28	No proposed amendment	
15. Section 29	Amendment of section 29 -	No proposed amendment	
	court proceedings		
16. Section 30	Insertion of section 30A -	No proposed amendment	The insertion of section 30A is
	residence of a child		supported in its entirety.
17.	Deletion of Part 3 of Chapter 3		
18. Section 34	Amendment of section 34 of	No proposed amendment	
	the Principal Act		
19. Section 35	Amendment of section 35	No proposed amendment	The amendment is supported.
20. Section 40	Amendment of section 40	No proposed amendment	
21.	Insertion of Section 41A	Proposed amendment:	There has been a development in
	Regulations		case law in South Africa on this
			issue, and there may be a need for
			regulations.

Clause number	Clause title	Proposed amendment/addition	Reasons/Rationale
		We propose that paragraph (k) be inserted,	
		which will provide for the provisions of	
		section 40 of the Act.	
22. Section 44	Amendment of section 44 -	Proposed addition:	The proposed provision does not
	geographical jurisdiction	"(3) A matter may, on request by a party or	indicate who can initiate such a
		a person affected by the matter, be	transfer of the matter. Furthermore,
		transferred from a children's court to	the provision reads as if the matter
		another children's court having jurisdiction	can be transferred from a children's
		if it would be in the best interest of the child."	court to another court, i.e., a
			regional or high court. Our
			proposed wording makes the
			section neat and clear that the
			transfer of the matter is between
			two children's courts.
23.			
24. Section 46	Amendment of section 46	Supported	The insertion of section 1(c.A) and
		No proposed amendment	(c.B) regarding guardianship order
			is supported as now the
			guardianship application process
			will be accessible to everyone
			wishing to make the application.

Clause number	Clause title	Proposed amendment/addition	Reasons/Rationale
25. Section 49	Amendment of section 49-	No proposed amendment	
	Forum hearings		
26. Section 52	Amendment of section 52 -	No proposed amendment	
	Rules and court proceedings		
27. Section 57	Amendment of section 57-	No proposed amendment	
	compulsory attendance of		
	persons involved in		
	proceedings		
28. Section 62	Amendment of section 62 -		
	Professional support		
29. – 63	Amendments	No proposed amendments on clauses 29 –	
		63	
65.	Amendment of section 146	Proposed amendment:	It is opined that service delivery for
			young children must be prioritised
		146(4)(c) "to make prevention and early	in accordance with the Welfare
		intervention programmes available to	White Paper. While children of
		children below and above to school-going	school going age access services
		age".	through schools, the majority of
			children under school going age are
			not accessing services. However,
			there may be children of school-

Clause number	Clause title	Proposed amendment/addition	Reasons/Rationale
			going age who are not in school- it
			is thus important not to lose
			vulnerable groups based on age.
66.	Amendment of section 147	No proposed amendment	
69.	Amendment of section 170	Proposed amendment:	This is to avoid confusion, particularly in practice.
		The insertion of subsection 5A when	
		reading paragraphs (b) and (c) does not	
		read well, and we proposed merging the	
		two paragraphs to read as one.	
70 101	Amendments	No proposed amendments on clauses 70 –	
		101.	
102.	Amendment of section 251	Proposed amendment:	Spelling error.
		In subsection 1(B), there is a letter missing,	
		and we propose that it be amended and	
		read as <u>fraud</u>	
103. – 118.	Amendments	No proposed amendments to clauses 103	
		to 118.	
118.	Amendment of section 295	Proposed amendment:	Make sure that surrogate motherhood agreements are properly regulated and also taking

Clause number	Clause title	Proposed amendment/addition	Reasons/Rationale
		We proposed that paraph (c) (vi) and (vii)	into account the health and well-
		should not be deleted. We further proposed	being of the surrogate mother. This
		that there should be an insertion of	argument is supported by recent
		paragraph (c) (viii), which provides that a	court judgments relating to
		woman should not be a surrogate mother	surrogacy in South Africa.1
		more than 3 times	
		Proposed amendment:	This is also informed by recent
			judgments where the Court asked
		We further proposed in section 295 that	the question whether, in the report
		there should be an insertion under	compiled by the psychologist or
		paragraph (e) (x) indicating that the best	counsellor the children of the
		interests of the living children of the	surrogate are considered. Taking
		surrogate mother must be considered.	into account their age and level of
			maturity. ² While the court found
			that a psychological report is not
			always necessary, the interests of
			the children of the surrogate must
			always be considered.

¹ The judgment is attached. ² The judgment is attached hereto.

Clause number	Clause title	Proposed amendment/addition	Reasons/Rationale